Summary of Concerns with NYCHA's 2023 PNA (Physical Needs Assessment)

NYCHA's 2023 Physical Needs Assessment (PNA) claims capital repair needs are \$78.3 billion—compared to their \$31.8 billion number in 2017. However, a brief look at the methods of the 2023 PNA reveal an inaccurate representation of the needs of NYCHA developments broadly. As such, it should not be used as a basis to justify conversions to RAD/PACT or the Trust.

Key Concerns

- While the 2017 PNA inspected all developments, the 2023 PNA inspected a 'representative sample' of only 10-15% apartments in only 30 out of 264 developments, or roughly 1 in 5 total NYC public housing units. An independent needs assessment should happen at every development so residents have accurate numbers.
- 2. The developments being chosen for RAD/PACT conversions under the 2024 Annual Plan are not the developments that had the highest needs in the PNA report.

 Conversions are usually selected in neighborhoods undergoing higher levels of gentrification, not on the needs of the developments.
- 3. It is confusing to compare the 2023 assessment, which estimates needs of \$78.3 billion over the next 20 years, to the 2017 assessment, which estimates needs of \$31.8 billion over the next 5 years. NYCHA should be appropriately comparing and centering the 2023 5-year physical needs estimate: \$60.3 billion.
- 4. The 2023 PNA attributes \$18.9 billion over 5 years to 'market price escalation' (the impact of inflation and high market prices) which inflates estimates of repairs.
- 5. Inflated numbers may be used to justify RAD/PACT conversions, or worse, demolition. The planned demolition of Fulton, Elliott, Chelsea and Chelsea Addition Houses is being justified by similarly inflated estimates, even as residents there fight for comparatively cheaper repairs that would enable them to stay in their homes and avoid demolition.
- 6. Regardless of the numbers, the PNA reflects NYCHA's mismanagement and HUD's disinvestment in Section 9 public housing communities. NYCHA and HUD should be accountable to our communities instead of selling off our homes to private developers.

We are concerned that the PNA can be used to justify conversions of traditional Section 9 public housing apartments into privately-managed Section 8 apartments under the RAD/PACT* program. Using inflated numbers paints the picture that our homes cannot be fixed quickly under the traditional Section 9 public housing model and is misleading. We need numbers that reflect the actual needs of our homes, with a strategy to meet them that doesn't involve sacrificing our rights as public housing tenants.

Further information is needed regarding the selection process for conversion. NYCHA often targets developments with rising property values rather than those with the most urgent needs, suggesting that decisions are based in part on wealth that can be generated through privatization or demolition/disposition.

Read our alternative solutions here: https://www.savesection9.org/demands

Difference between
20-year and
5 year 2023 PNA:
\$18 B

Adjustment due
to Market Price
Escalation:
\$18.9 B

9

10.
2017 PNA
\$31.8 B

Opers.

Uninflated
2023 PNA:

\$41.4 B

* RAD, the Rental Assistance Demonstration program—known as PACT in NYC—is a federal initiative to 'reposition' or sell off public housing developments to private management companies that will convert them to Section 8 Project-Based Rental Assistance. This is a voucher that stays with the apartment, not with the resident. RAD/PACT is a form of privatization that converts traditional public housing to privately-managed buildings.

www.savesection9.org
(516) 669-0642
savesection9@gmail.com
www.facebook.com/groups/savesection9